# INTRODUCTION

**Sabrina Juillet Garzón**
(Université Sorbonne Paris Nord, Pléiade EA 7338)
**Jean Berton**
(Professor Emeritus, Université de Toulouse Jean Jaurès)

Echoing the reputed characteristics of their national emblems, the attractive flower of the thistle, the strength of the wild cat, the fearlessness of the unicorn, and their cautionary motto *Nemo me impune lacessit*, the Scots frequently call on their spirit of resistance. These reflect a very specific image of Scotland. Whether real or fantasized, the concepts of freedom and resistance evolved throughout history as well as in their expressions in arts and literature. Their very definitions changed depending on the political or cultural needs and ambitions of Scotland in the context of its relations with England, the nations of the United Kingdom and Europe, if not also with the rest of the world. These concepts have been so long and so often associated to Scotland that they participated to create a stereotyped perception of the Scots. This book aims at assessing their part of reality and influence on the shaping of the Scots' image and character. It proposes to the reader a study of this national specificity based on historical and literary approaches, hoping these will shed new lights and motivation new perspectives in the field of study on Scottish identity.

Nevertheless, a cultural approach to the study of the promotion of acts of resistance in Scotland tends to show that, in the context of the British Union, the nation never fails to rise to every challenge. The underlying theory of this collaborative volume is that the specific national characteristics of Scotland are steeped in her spirit of resistance.

History tends to reveal that the resistance of the Scots has always aimed to remain independent and free before and after the Union of the Crowns and, a century later, of the Union of the Parliaments. Ever since the Caledonians, including the Picts, successfully resisted the Roman occupation and Scandinavian powerful assaults, while the descendants of the Celts were opposing the descendants of the North Anglians, the Scots have valued the idea of independence when faced with hegemonic attempts by their southern neighbours.

Back in the Middle Ages, the Scots resisted subjection or vassalage to England and stood up against the strong influence of England on the power of Rome by signing the Declaration of Arbroath. Now, they are up in arms to defend their links with the European Union, which shows that, far from being against any form of union, they clearly reject any form of oppression. The Scots have managed to preserve their Kirk, their education, their native languages, and their private connections with European nations.

*Freedom as Resistance in Scotland* is based on facts: whenever the Scots lost confidence, the efficiency of their resistance decreased dramatically. However, the dark days of the Thatcher governments ironically boosted their confidence in the vigour of their own nation: was it what the screenwriter of *Highlander*, Gregory Widen, aimed to illustrate in his narrative (produced in 1986) of the aptly-named never-dying character of Connor MacLeod?[1]

* * *

Freedom is a tremendous concept shared by all individuals on earth, yet resisting a definition that can be acknowledged by everyone. In this modest publication, we have agreed to focus on the aspect of resistance, hence the title: Freedom as Resistance.

Because resistance can be defined as an opposition to a plan of action against multilingualism in Scotland, therefore within the UK, there is a necessity to explore the multilingual nation of Scotland. If we regard the century-old strife between Gaelic-speakers, Scots-speakers, and English-speakers, we choose to limit our scope to the case of languages, and more especially to Scots. Because we can find within ourselves the power not to be affected by something that is alien to us under the guise of infection – a polemic-ridden word voiced through the medium of John of Gaunt in Shakespeare's *King Richard II* –, we can give vent to the potent, albeit a low key, voice of art, after the fashion of poetry. Because laws of sociology, science, and economy are often seen looming ahead of us, we tend to spontaneously react to what is sensed as threatening. A first case is found in alcoholism necessitating resistance to social condemnation, another in globalisation calling for resistance, through competition, to the danger of being swamped into nefarious laws of the market – Scotland can take action from her experience of the damaging effects of imperialism. And because Scotland is proud of her resistance fighters, one needs to probe into the notion of trespassing identified heritage from the national hero, Wallace, to today's complex forms of immigration.

This book is a collection of articles organized in three chapters – Firstly, 'Resistance, a hallmark of Scottishness' means to explore the roots of the origins of the Scottish sense of resistance. Secondly, 'Freedom as Resistance in languages and arts' aims to highlight a strong opposition to an English-centred point of view, multilingualism in

---

1. MacLeod is deriving from Gaelic – 'Mac' meaning 'son (of)' and 'leòd' meaning 'cutting, maiming, mangling'. This is a rare occurrence of the word found in Edward Dwelly's *The Illustrated Gaelic-English Dictionary*, Eighth edition, Glasgow, Gairm Publications, 1977, p. 583.

Scotland being used as an assumed heritage from native languages for that purpose. And thirdly, in 'Aspects of Freedom as Resistance to social condemnation and competition', two aspects are selected to serve as the extremes of the scope one could think of – drink and marketing, and since trespassing is a variant of the catchphrase 'law and order' meaning not to be welcome to enter a land, however large it can be, the notion of immigration is considered by some a boon to the nation and, by others, a modern development of what William Wallace had to fight when Edward I kept hammering his way into Scotland.

## I - 'Resistance, a Hallmark of Scottishness'

The idea of Resistance and Freedom appears first commonly and traditionally when dealing with the relations of Scotland with England. The special bond between Scotland and France from the Middle Ages reinforced and, indirectly, promoted this stormy relation between the two neighbouring kingdoms. In his paper "Landscaping Supremacy. An Account on the Representation of Scotland in French Medieval Sources", Clément Guézais proposes to focus on the alliance between France and Scotland, which was born in the XIII$^{th}$ century and reinforced militarily and culturally during the following centuries. He shows how, during the Hundred Years War, the reputation of Scotland as a resisting kingdom influenced the French, at war with England at the time, in establishing both a cultural and military resistance. This gave birth to the creation of the belief in some kind of national superiority and in the emergence of strong national identities determined to protect their freedom and independence from the English.

Later on, during the Renaissance period, the concepts of freedom and resistance had repercussion in the expression of Scottish culture and politics. Allison Steenson, in her article "Scotland in Europe and Europe in Scotland. Translation, Internationalism and Creative Adaptation at the Court of James VI", takes us to the Stuart Renaissance preceding the Union of the Crowns to demonstrate how deeply European Scotland was and how this impacted the perception of Scottish identity in European literature and arts. Through a study of the foreign poets present at James's VI court in Edinburgh, she shows how the influence of European poetry and its translation gave birth to a specific Scottish literary culture which remained even after the Union of the Crowns and the move of the Scottish Jacobean court to England. This proved once again, that the support and influence of Europe participated in the affirmation of Scotland's identity to avoid uniformity with England. This tendency was reinforced during the XVII$^{th}$ century with, mainly, the participation of the Church.

In "Securing Religious Freedom: the Resistance of the Churches in Scotland between 1688 and 1693", Sabrina Juillet Garzón demonstrates the importance of religious resistance within the context of the Union of the Crowns. The recognition of an official national Scottish Church had become indeed, since 1603, an obsession among the Scots. They believed that a free Kirk, independent from the Church of

England, would be the guarantee of peace with England as well as a barrier against a total Union. This belief reached its climax when William III and Mary II were called to sit on the triple throne of England, Scotland and Ireland, in 1688. She examines both the national Presbyterian and Episcopalian resistance to the English model and the system devised to make the Scottish Church(es) the warrant(s) of the Scots' identity and interests.

## II - 'Freedom as Resistance in Languages and Arts'

The Union of Parliaments sparked off the pungent issue of the languages within Great Britain, and this led to the native languages of Scotland being dramatically jeopardised. Milena Kaličanin's paper, "Writing in Scots as an Act of Resistance: Examples from Scottish Poetry", focuses on the work of several Scottish poets (Burns, MacDiarmid, Leonard, Lochhead and Robertson) who regard creative writing and speaking in public as a political act. This idea is further exemplified in the research through the analysis of their selected poetry, mostly written in Scots. The common ground for these rather diverse artists is that writing in Scots should be considered as a demonstration of a potent act of resistance against the omnipresent English domination. The critical insights of these poets are combined with the theoretical framework provided by Scottish history and culture scholars, Neil Oliver and Thomas Devine, in order to emphasize their continuing concern with the relevance of Scots for the understanding of Scottish identity. Special attention in the paper is also paid to Alan Bissett's blog, "Is Writing in Scots an Act of Resistance?" (2019).

The idea of freedom as resistance in literature and poetry is much older than the British Union. When the Hundred Years War came to an end and the English put an end to the official use of French in England; the Scots abandoned the word Inglis and endorsed the term Scots. Popular poets, or Makars, then championed the representation of their nation. The name 'Makar' was revived when Scotland regained her Parliament in 1999, and the New Makars very quickly promoted Scotland's culture and identity. In her paper, "Dissension through Poetry: the Troublemakars", Christelle Ferrere calls "troublemakars" those influent, revolutionary, provocative poets acting as resisting agents and at the same time opening the way to still more freedom, for Scottish literature and culture. Through a study of works of poets such as Edwin Morgan, Hugh MacDiarmid and Tom Leonard, she explores the incidence of their writings in the evolution of the idea of resistance of some kind of Scottish identity, which she redefines here, as well as its break with tradition and national stereotypes, making of Scottish literature a specificity in the literary world.

Drama is not left out and gives way to many expressions of these positions. In her study titled "Mythopoe(t)ic Dramatic Figuration of Jacobite dissenters by François Édouard Joachim Coppée; or the Art of Dissenting", Danièle Berton-Charrière analyses *Les Jacobites*, a play in verse and in French by François Edouard Coppée (1842-

1908). She argues that the playwright not only shows the futility and uselessness of the Jacobites' enterprise in 1745-1746, but also passes a stylistic and generic metadiscourse along with critical comments through a dramatic and theatrical example. The dramatic mise-en-abyme provides an emphasised aspect of dissenting enacted by Bonnie Prince Charlie and his followers. What is more, she propounds that *Les Jacobites* dramatises and stages the struggle between Romanticism and more classic models, including its preceding Neo-classicism, between past and present, traditions and modernity, as well as between conflicting values. The play exposes the two trends in their confrontation through its historical fable and *diegesis*, treated within rich transtextual and intersemiotic networks from which emerges a personal style serving legendary heroes.

### III - 'Aspects of Freedom as Resistance to Social Condemnation and Competition',

This is a broad chapter in which two aspects are selected to serve as the extremes of the scope one could think of – drink and marketing. In his article, "Free from the Demon Drink: Labour and Temperance, 1830-1930", Christian Civardi refers to Hugh MacDiarmid's notion of freedom from affectation, opposing respectability – meaning religion, temperance and respectability – to liberation from drink. He highlights the connection between evangelical revival and Socialist correctness: the revolutionaries erecting temperance as moral basis of revolutionary rectitude, meaning that the drink trade was an act of bourgeois decadence and class collaboration, which caused the defeat of the labour movement for not supporting prohibition before World War I. The chaos of the First World War led the Labour party to diverge from its previously assertive pro-temperance stance so as not to alienate potential Catholic support, increased by the high number of Irish immigrants. The financial crisis of 1929 and the ensuing political crisis in 1931, the Independent Labour Party voluntarily terminated its affiliation to the Scottish Labour Party. With some kind of relief, from a Scottish point of view, the State was seen to abandon its puritan crusade on behalf of a post-Victorian 'godly commonwealth'.

Today's expectations of the Scots towards the government changed. The Devolution made its way and the idea of an autonomous, if not independent nation is now central. Lauren Brancaz-McCartan's article, "The Marketing of Dissent? VisitScotland's Empowerment of the Scots", aims at demonstrating that VisitScotland's 2009 *Caledonia* advert can be interpreted as triggering cultural dissent, which forced VisitScotland to re-assess the images of Scotland it projects to the world. Through VisitScotland's latest advertising campaigns, *The Spirit of Scotland* and *Scotland is Now*, the Scottish national tourist board has been training Scotland's businesses and citizens to depart from traditional ways of depicting the homeland as frozen in the past, and to reflect, instead, what modern Scotland's national identity is about. With the support of the Scottish Government, VisitScotland has been empowering the Scots to shape their

own cultural identity and to define themselves as a unique, modern, and self-sufficient people.

In recent years, Scotland has been developing a different policy trajectory from the rest of the UK in the context of post-devolution nation-building, bringing to light new forms of territorial politics. In fact, the process of devolution has had significant changes on local parties' policies. It has allowed political actors to develop their own responses on issues affecting Scotland – as part of the nation-building project", a consensus has been reached between political actors to reconstruct the nation. In "Scotland's Recent Immigration Strategies or Union-Resistant Responses to the United Kingdom", Wafa El Fekih Said argues that one aspect of "dissenting Scotland" becomes clear when examining immigration and refugee issues, as immigration, a reserved matter, is exclusively dealt with at the level of the British government due to the multi-level aspect of the devolution process. However, in spite of being unable to decide on immigration at the devolved level, Scottish political parties do present a diverging policy strategy from their British counterparts, advancing arguments on the specific demographic needs of the country. Diverging policies are coupled with relatively less hostile public attitudes to immigration, and are more recently confirmed through the results of the Brexit referendum, where Scots clearly voted in favour of staying within the EU. Her paper explores the dissenting aspects of Scottish immigration strategies as presented by political parties with special focus on the policy initiatives following the Brexit referendum.

Resistance, Jean Berton concludes in "Aspects of the Wallace Syndrome of Dissenting", can be spotted in most aspects of Scottish culture – with variations in intensity and form all along the history line of Scotland: dissenting Scots within Scotland are as many as Scots dissenting from foreign powers. Still however prone to diverging the Scots may appear, Scotland has proved her ability to stand on her own and to be innovative in many fields, and the examples surveyed in his paper can be viewed as mere landmarks. Scotland disagreeing with England is an age-long story; as it is, foreign observers cannot help wondering what the outcome of the Brexit crisis will be. Scottish nationalists have repeatedly voiced their opposition to be drawn into English policies without their consent. With the benefit of hindsight, Jean Berton argues, would it be too bold to say that William Wallace's experience was a form of predestination, hence the idea of syndrome? Or is it a synecdoche for the conflicts between Scottishness and globalisation? How far can one think that, within the context of the United Kingdom, England has been trespassing on Scotland's private property?